The validity of the proceedings is being questioned by the point of order. We will abide by it.

The collective responsibility to this House is there or not? There are precedents, I know it. In that background, Art. 174(1) as the Hon’ble Minister Sri Samarasimha Reddy read out, Art. 163, 164, the collective responsibility is being at stalemate .... 16 also, the Hon’ble Minister Sri Samarasimha Reddy read out, Art. 174(1) as the Hon’ble Minister Sri Samarasimha Reddy read out, Art. 163, 164, the collective responsibility is at stalemate. ....
The problem is with the council of Ministers.
How they are authorised to occupy their seats without your permission.

As on to-day they have resigned. Is it constitutionally valid? Are they entitled to take their respective seats? Is it not illegal? As on to-day there is no Council of Ministers. It is not at all functioning.
***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.
Srí P. Anoka Gajapathi Raju (Vijayanagaram):— Sir, the Constitution as is in its totality, here, we are discussing about two things. Both the articles are extremely Important. Sir, I am quoting from Kaul and Shakdhar, from page 616:—

"The Council of Ministers is collectively responsible to the Lok Sabha. The responsibility is joint and indivisible. There is no specific provision in the Constitution, laying down that the individual responsibility of a Minister and his accountability to Parliament for all acts of omission and commission in dealing of his charge." This is one thing Sir.

Another thing, in page 617 Sir,

"The Cabinet responsibility to Lok Sabha, implies that not only the Prime Minister but also a substantial majority of Members of the Council should be chosen from amongst the Members of the Lok Sabha - but it is not unconstitutional if the Prime Minister or a number of Members are from the Rajya Sabha."

Sir, if you read further on, it clearly states, that the Ministers have to have confidence and the Chief Minister has to have the confidence of the Council of Ministers. Sir,
recently in the Press we have been reading the statement of various "MINISTERS' INCLINED". I emphasise the word "INCLINED" and there cannot be part of the decision of the Chief Minister, and Sir, this implies that they are disassociating with the Chief Minister's decision.

Sir, under Article 174 it is summoning the August House. Article 164-2 deals totally, which is a continuous article, that the council of Ministers headed by the Chief Minister is responsible and accountable to this august house. When there is dissension from among the Ministers to create to such an extent where they disassociated publicly with one another, Sir, it is a break down of Constitutional Government. So, article 164-2 is not in play to-day at all. This is the problem. Even conventions are developed, even article 174 conventions have developed over the years, where the Cabinet of Ministers meet and they recommend to the Governor. Then the House is summoned Sir. True, the Council of Ministers were consulted after the House was summoned. This also we have heard in the Press and that the Chief Minister apologised. Sir, now-a-days apologies have no value Sir. Everyone is apologising - you are expunging from the Records of the House. Sir, this has become a common affair.

Mr. Speaker:- It is not relevant here please.

Sri P. Ashoka Gajapathi Raju:- Sir, we can also make insight comments but it is irrelevant as observed by you. Therefore we will not give insight comments - but the important thing here is that the Council of Ministers have to be collectively responsible to this House by sending in Resignation to whichever their party head or whatever - stating that they are disassociating themselves with the decisions of Government Sir. That itself is against the article 164-2 and therefore this Council of Ministers does not have the collective responsibility to this House.

This is what we wanted you to note Sir. And as per the article 174 also - post-sanction of the Cabinet is incorrect Sir. It is against the convention Sir. What we all request you is to correct the situation Sir. We need this House. There are too many problems of the people that have to be reflected here. Kindly correct the situation Sir.

Mr. Speaker:- Yes - I have followed.
Council of Ministers will be responsible for the House" and Item 2 of Schedule 2 says "Proposals to dissolve the Legislative or the State - and proposal to implement legislature is not mentioned in this. Only in case of the proposals to dissolve the Legislature of the State, a reference should be made to the Council of Ministers." This is very clear in the Business Rules.
Mr. Speaker:—Now, I have to give my ruling.

Mr. Speaker:—I am not going to give chance to anybody.

Mr. Speaker:—No, No, I am not going to give to anybody.

Sri Ch. Vidyasagar Rao:—The House cannot be run on the whins and fancies of the Congress Party. It is not in order. Then, how can we continue here?

Mr. Speaker:—No, No.

We are temporary artists. Democracy is permanent. We are supposed to play effectively. Either Mr. Rosaiah or the Chief Minister or the concerned Ministers should clarify.
as to whether the summoning of the House is in order or not.

(Sri M. Raghumareddy and others rose to speak)

Mr. Speaker:— I am not going to hear anybody now. Advantage shall not be taken to be weakness. You must take your seats.

Sri P. Ashoka Gajapathi Raju:— What about the other points?

Mr. Speaker:— I am not going to give you. Please take your seat.

aKT^o^* As per the procedure in Kaul and Shakder, page-145 to which the Hon’ble Members have referred, the Governor shall summon or prorogue the Legislature a convention shall be developed that the Chief Minister should fix the date of summoning or prorogation after consulting the Presiding Officer concerned. The Governor may suggest an alternative date, but it shall be left to the Chief Minister or the Cabinet. According to the Business Rules, Rule 32 (1) says that all cases relating to summoning or prorogation of the Legislature shall be circulated to the Chief Minister for issue of orders. All the cases that are to be referred to the Cabinet for approval are detailed in the Schedule-2 of the Business Rules. Proposal to summon the Legislature is not mentioned in the Schedule-2. Only in the case of proposal to dissolve the Legislature of the State, reference should be made to the Council of Ministers. It is a proposal to summon the Legislature and it is the subject of the Chief Minister. Such a proposal need not be referred to the Cabinet as per Schedule-2.
As per the Business Rules, the proposal to summon the Legislature do not require the approval of the Cabinet. The point raised by the Leader of Opposition and others is overruled and the summoning notification is in order.

(1) As per the Business Rules, the proposal to summon the Legislature do not require the approval of the Cabinet. The point raised by the Leader of Opposition and others is overruled and the summoning notification is in order.

(2) As per the Business Rules, the proposal to summon the Legislature do not require the approval of the Cabinet. The point raised by the Leader of Opposition and others is overruled and the summoning notification is in order.

J. No. 129-3
(4) अस्तु जागरूकता कलेक्टर

नवम्बर 14, 1992

उद्देश्य: राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता दिवस के अवसर पर जागरूकता कलेक्टर, आपको कुछ नए निर्देशों देना है।

यहाँ एक निर्देश देना है: "राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता दिवस में, आपकी भूमिका बहुत महत्वपूर्ण होगी। राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता के लिए आपके अभ्यास और अभियान विशेष रूप से महत्वपूर्ण होंगे। आप राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता के लिए अपनी कीमत दें।"

सामयिकी रूप से, 1985 के स्वतंत्रता दिवस के मामले में, आप ने अपनी भूमिका को उज़ा़ दिखाया। लेकिन, 1990 के स्वतंत्रता दिवस के मामले में, आप ने अपनी भूमिका को उज़ा़ नहीं दिखाया। इसलिए, आपकी भूमिका को उज़ा़ दिखाने के लिए, आपको अपनी अभ्यास को उज़ा़ देना होगा।

(नामांकन के संबंध में)

आपके, उद्देश्य के तहत, नहीं कोई निर्देश दिखाया।

(5) अस्तु जागरूकता कलेक्टर

नवम्बर 15, 1992

उद्देश्य: राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता दिवस के अवसर पर जागरूकता कलेक्टर, आपको कुछ नए निर्देशों देना है।

यहाँ एक निर्देश देना है: "राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता दिवस में, आपकी भूमिका बहुत महत्वपूर्ण होगी। राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता के लिए आपके अभ्यास और अभियान विशेष रूप से महत्वपूर्ण होंगे। आप राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता के लिए अपनी कीमत दें।"

सामयिकी रूप से, 1955 के स्वतंत्रता दिवस के मामले में, आप ने अपनी भूमिका को उज़ा़ दिखाया। लेकिन, 1962 के स्वतंत्रता दिवस के मामले में, आप ने अपनी भूमिका को उज़ा़ नहीं दिखाया। इसलिए, आपकी भूमिका को उज़ा़ दिखाने के लिए, आपको अपनी अभ्यास को उज़ा़ देना होगा।

(4) अस्तु जागरूकता कलेक्टर

नवम्बर 16, 1992

उद्देश्य: राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता दिवस के अवसर पर जागरूकता कलेक्टर, आपको कुछ नए निर्देशों देना है।

यहाँ एक निर्देश देना है: "राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता दिवस में, आपकी भूमिका बहुत महत्वपूर्ण होगी। राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता के लिए आपके अभ्यास और अभियान विशेष रूप से महत्वपूर्ण होंगे। आप राष्ट्रीय स्वतंत्रता के लिए अपनी कीमत दें।"
(5) The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

It is noteworthy that the period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

(6) The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.

The period of 1952 marks a beginning of a new era, and this period has been
characterized by a new spirit.
(7) ఐత్యములు సంజనలు మాసిక నిరాకరణ కార్యాచారం
నుండి.

మామలు చేసినది:- "ఐత్యములు సంజనలు మాసిక నిరాకరణ కార్యాచారం
నుండి, ప్రతి సంవత్సరం అందించవచ్చు. ఈ కార్యాచారం ప్రారంభించిన సంవత్సరం
1952-53 మధ్య అడుగు మంది మెగట్రాను యుక్తి చేశాయి. ఈ సంవత్సరం మే 8-9 నుండి కాలసాగించి, తరువాతి సంవత్సరం మే 10-11
నుండి కాలసాగించి, తరువాతి సంవత్సరం మే 11-12 నుండి కాలసాగించి, తరువాతి సంవత్సరం
మే 12-1 నుండి కాలసాగించారు. ఈ కార్యాచారం ప్రారంభించిన సంవత్సరం
మే 8-9 నుండి కాలసాగించి, తరువాతి సంవత్సరం మే 10-11 నుండి కాలసాగించి, తరువాతి సంవత్సరం
మే 11-12 నుండి కాలసాగించి, తరువాతి సంవత్సరం మే 12-1 నుండి కాలసాగించారు.

మామలు చేసినది:- మామలు చేసిన సంవత్సరం సంవత్సరం కలిగి ఉండాలి.

(7) ఐత్యములు సంజనలు మాసిక నిరాకరణ కార్యాచారం
నుండి.

(ఐత్యములు సంజనలు మాసిక నిరాకరణ కార్యాచారం)

(ఐత్యములు సంజనలు మాసిక నిరాకరణ కార్యాచారం కార్యాచారం
నుండి)

సంఖ్య- 20 మాసా, 1992 కలిగి ఉండాలి.
5. సోఫియా జీడీ సాంఘాలు మార్చి నిపుణులు
కు సంబంధించి సంస్థ మండలాలు,
ప్రస్తుతం.

6. సోఫియా జీడీ సాంఘాలు మార్చి నిపుణులు
కు సంబంధించి సంస్థ మండలాలు,
ప్రస్తుతం.

7. సోఫియా జీడీ సాంఘాలు మార్చి నిపుణులు
కు సంబంధించి సంస్థ మండలాలు,
ప్రస్తుతం.